

The dynamics outside the paper: User Contributions to Online Dictionaries

Andrea Abel and Christian M. Meyer



TECHNISCHE
UNIVERSITÄT
DARMSTADT

EURAC
research

Electronic lexicography in the 21st century (eLex):
Thinking outside the paper,
Tallinn, Estonia, October 17–19, 2013.

Online dictionaries rely increasingly on their users and leverage methods for facilitating user contributions at basically any step of the lexicographic process.

- Mostly focused on specific type/dimension of user contribution
 - e.g., Carr (1997), Storrer (1998, 2010), Køhler Simonsen (2005), Fuertes-Olivera (2009), Melchior (2012), Lew (2011, 2013)
- Ambiguous, partly overlapping terms:

(fuzzy) simultaneous feedback
collective free multiple-language
bottom-up lexicography
collaborative-institutional dictionaries
user contribution
collaborative lexicography
lexicographic democracy
semi-collaborative dictionaries
user participation democratization
internet reference works
institutional internet reference works
user involvement

How to effectively plan the user contributions for new and established dictionaries?

- Comprehensive and systematic classification is still missing
- Mann (2010): analysis of 88 online dictionaries
 - User contributions roughly categorized as **direct / indirect contributions** and **exchange with other dictionary users**
 - Little detail given, since outside the scope of the analysis
 - We use this as a basis for our work

We propose a novel classification of the different types of user contributions based on many practical examples

Functional classification

| 1. Direct user contributions | 2. Indirect user contributions | 3. Accessory user contributions |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

1. Direct user contributions

*Additions, modifications, deletions
of dictionary articles (or parts of them)
performed by a dictionary user.*

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

1. Direct user contributions

Additions, modifications, deletions of dictionary articles (or parts of them) performed by a dictionary user.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries

- dictionaries completely built by users without editorial control
- fixed lexicographic instructions vs. structural openness
- dictionary-specific vs. general-purpose user interface (e.g., wiki)



Wiktionary
['wɪkʃənri] n.,
a wiki-based Open
Content dictionary



1. Direct user contributions

Additions, modifications, deletions of dictionary articles (or parts of them) performed by a dictionary user.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries

- provided by major dictionary publishers
- usually no direct modifications/deletions of existing articles
- collect evidence and suggestions for improving editorial dictionaries
- keep dictionary users interested in the publisher's activities



1. Direct user contributions

Additions, modifications, deletions of dictionary articles (or parts of them) performed by a dictionary user.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries

- submissions of new entries, donations of word lists
- carefully examined by professional editors
- directly integrated into the dictionary if valid



2. Indirect user contributions

Suggestions, corrections, supplementary material, comments, external content, usage data provided by users as feedback to the dictionary makers.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

2. Indirect user contributions

Suggestions, corrections, supplementary material, comments, external content, usage data provided by users as feedback to the dictionary makers.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

Explicit feedback

- suggestions, wishes, error corrections on existing content
- supplementary material (e.g., illustrations, quotations)
- quality judgements
- form-based vs. free form feedback



Feedback forms



OED Submission Form

Click [here](#) for information about what details the OED needs.

If you have multiple quotations to submit from the same title, we recommend that you enable the [multiple quotations](#) functionality within your browser.

* indicates a **mandatory** field

*WORD or PHRASE illustrated

*Part of Speech

please select...

*Reason

please select...

Sense number

As defined in the OED Online entry

Report a mistake

Please use this form if you wish to notify us of **typos** or **blatantly obvious translation mistakes**. If you have questions regarding specific terminology or language usage, please post your question in the ["Wrong entry?"](#)

The following entry in the dictionary needs to be corrected:

English (*)

German (*)

What is wrong with this entry? (*)

Is this translation correct and useful?

English

sinopulmonary syndrome

German

sinopulmonales Syndrom {n}

Class

noun

Comment

• <http://salerno.uni-muenster.de...>

YES (100% correct)

NO / MAYBE ...

Skip »

» Guidelines

2. Indirect user contributions

Suggestions, corrections, supplementary material, comments, external content, usage data provided by users as feedback to the dictionary makers.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|-------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| • Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries | • Explicit feedback – form-based feedback – free form feedback | • Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users – unidirectional communication – bidirectional communication |
| • Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries | • Implicit feedback – log file analysis – external user-generated content | • Exchange among dictionary users |
| • Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | | |

Implicit feedback

- provided by users through their usage of the dictionary
- no explicit user effort
- contribution often not realized
 - *log files, Google Analytics*
 - *favorite articles, word lists*
 - *external user-generated content (e.g., Flickr, Twitter)*

eldit

Elektronisches Lernerwörterbuch Deutsch-Italienisch
Dizionario elettronico per apprendenti Italiano-Tedesco

wordnik

DUDEN

Base lexicale du français

3. Accessory user contributions

Exchange between the dictionary makers and their users or among the users themselves beyond the dictionary content.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

3. Accessory user contributions

Exchange between the dictionary makers and their users or among the users themselves beyond the dictionary content.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users

- blogs, newsletters, social networks, etc.
- language games, professional language service
- unidirectional communication vs. bidirectional communication



3. Accessory user contributions

Exchange between the dictionary makers and their users or among the users themselves beyond the dictionary content.

| Direct user contributions | Indirect user contributions | Accessory user contributions |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

Exchange among the dictionary users

- forums
- discussion pages
- user comments

Wiktionary
[ˈwɪkʃənɹɪ] *n.*,
a wiki-based Open
Content dictionary



New classification of user contributions:

| 1. Direct user contributions | 2. Indirect user contributions | 3. Accessory user contributions |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Contributions to open-collaborative dictionaries• Contributions to collaborative-institutional dictionaries• Contributions to semi-collaborative dictionaries | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Explicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– form-based feedback– free form feedback• Implicit feedback<ul style="list-style-type: none">– log file analysis– external user-generated content <p data-bbox="724 1110 1242 1355">More practical examples in the paper!</p> | <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Exchange between dictionary makers and dictionary users<ul style="list-style-type: none">– unidirectional communication– bidirectional communication• Exchange among dictionary users |

Thank you for your attention!

Questions?

- Carr, M. (1997). Internet Dictionaries and Lexicography. *International Journal of Lexicography*, 10(3), pp. 209–230.
- Fuertes-Olivera, P.A. (2009). The Function Theory of Lexicography and Electronic Dictionaries: WIKTIONARY as a Prototype of Collective Free Multiple-Language Internet Lexicography. In H. Bergenholtz, S. Nielsen & S. Tarp (eds) *Lexicography at a Crossroads: Dictionaries and Encyclopedias Today, Lexicographical Tools Tomorrow*. Bern: Peter Lang, pp. 99–134.
- Køhler Simonsen, H. (2005). User Involvement in Corporate LSP Intranet Lexicography. In H. Gottlieb, J.E. Mogensen & A. Zettersten (eds.) *Symposium on Lexicography XI. Proceedings of the Eleventh International Symposium on Lexicography May 2-4, 2002, at the University of Copenhagen*. Tübingen: Niemeyer, pp. 489–510.
- Lew, R. (2011). Online dictionaries of English. In P.A. Fuertes-Olivera & H. Bergenholtz (eds.) *e-Lxicography: The Internet, Digital Initiatives and Lexicography*. London/New York: Continuum, pp. 230–250.
- Lew, R. (2013). User-generated content (UGC) in English online dictionaries. In A. Abel & A. Klosa (eds.) *Ihr Beitrag bitte! – Der Nutzerbeitrag im Wörterbuchprozess* (OPAL – Online publizierte Arbeiten zur Linguistik). Mannheim: Institut für Deutsche Sprache, pp. 9–30.
- Mann, M. (2010). Internet-Wörterbücher am Ende der „Nullerjahre“: Der Stand der Dinge. Eine vergleichende Untersuchung beliebter Angebote hinsichtlich formaler Kriterien. In R.H. Gouws, U. Heid, St.J. Schierholz, W. Schweickard & H.E. Wiegand (eds.) *Lexicographica 26*. Berlin/New York: de Gruyter, pp. 19–46.
- Melchior, L. (2012). Halbkollaborativität und Inline-Lexikographie. Ansätze und Überlegungen zu Wörterbuchredaktion und Wörterbuchforschung am Beispiel LEO Deutsch-Italienisch. In R.H. Gouws, U. Heid, St.J. Schierholz, W. Schweickard & H.E. Wiegand (eds.) *Lexicographica 28*. Berlin/New York: de Gruyter, pp. 337–372.
- Melchior, L. (2013). Ansätze zu einer halbkollaborativen Lexikographie. In A. Abel & A. Klosa (eds.) *Ihr Beitrag bitte! – Der Nutzerbeitrag im Wörterbuchprozess* (OPAL – Online publizierte Arbeiten zur Linguistik). Mannheim: Institut für Deutsche Sprache, pp. 31–52.
- Storrer, A. (1998). Hypermedia-Wörterbücher: Perspektiven für eine neue Generation elektronischer Wörterbücher. In H. E. Wiegand (ed.) *Wörterbücher in der Diskussion III*. Tübingen: Niemeyer, pp. 107–135.
- Storrer, A. (2010). Deutsche Internet-Wörterbücher: Ein Überblick. In R. H. Gouws, U. Heid, St. J. Schierholz, W. Schweickard & H. E. Wiegand (eds.) *Lexicographica 27*, Berlin/New York: de Gruyter, pp. 155–164.

Dictionaries

Algemeen Nederlands Woordenboek. <http://anw.inl.nl>

Bab.la. <http://bab.la>

Base lexicale du français (BLF). <http://ilt.kuleuven.be/blf>

canoonet. <http://www.canoo.net>

dict.cc. <http://www.dict.cc>

Duden online (DO). <http://www.duden.de>

Elektronisches Lernerwörterbuch Deutsch-Italienisch (ELDIT). <http://www.eurac.edu/eldit>

Glosbe. <http://glosbe.com>

LEO. <http://dict.leo.org>

Macmillan Open Dictionary. <http://www.macmillandictionary.com/open-dictionary>

Merriam-Webster Open Dictionary. <http://nws.merriam-webster.com/opendictionary>

OmegaWiki. <http://www.omegawiki.org>

OpenThesaurus. <http://www.openththesaurus.de>

Oxford English Dictionary (OED). <http://www.oed.com>

Szenesprachenwiki. <http://szenesprachenwiki.de>

TechDictionary. <http://www.techdictionary.com>

Urban Dictionary. <http://www.urbandictionary.com>

Wikipedia. <http://www.wikipedia.org>

Wiktionary. <http://www.wiktionary.org>

Wordnik. <http://www.wordnik.com>

Kontakt / Contact

Andrea Abel

European Academy of Bozen/Bolzano (EURAC)
Institute for Specialised Communication
and Multilingualism

📍 Drususallee 1, 39100 Bolzano/Bozen, Italy

☎ +39 0471 055 121

📠 +39 0471 055 199

✉ andrea.abel (at) eurac.edu

Christian M. Meyer

Technische Universität Darmstadt
Ubiquitous Knowledge Processing Lab

📍 Hochschulstr. 10, 64289 Darmstadt, Germany

☎ +49 (0)6151 16–5386

📠 +49 (0)6151 16–5455

✉ meyer (at) ukp.informatik.tu-darmstadt.de

Rechtliche Hinweise

Die Folien sind für den persönlichen Gebrauch der Vortragsteilnehmer gedacht. Im Vortrag verwendete Photographien, Illustrationen, Wort- und Bildmarken sind Eigentum der jeweiligen Rechteinhaber oder Lizenzgeber. Um Missverständnisse zu vermeiden, wäre eine kurze Kontaktaufnahme vor Weitergabe oder -nutzung der Vortragsmaterialien empfehlenswert. Sofern Sie Ihre Rechte verletzt sehen, bitte ich ebenfalls um Kontaktaufnahme zur Klärung der Sachlage.

Legal Issues

The slides are intended for personal use by the audience of the talk. Photographies, illustrations, trademarks, or logos are property of the holder of rights. To avoid any misconceptions, I would strongly recommend to get in touch before reusing or redistributing the slides or any additional material of the talk. The same applies if you consider your rights infringed – please let me know to initiate further clarification.